



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

APPROVED MINUTES

May 1, 2018, 8:30 a.m.
Committee Room, 2nd Floor, City Hall
101 City Hall Plaza, Durham, NC

I. Call to Order

Chair Jordan called the meeting to order at 8:34 a.m.

II. Roll Call

Members Present:

Joseph Jordan, Chair
Tad DeBerry, Vice Chair
Matt Bouchard
Jonathan Dayan
Joe Fitzsimons
Katie Hamilton
Tom Kreger
Wanda Waiters

Unexcused Members Absent:

Le'Andre Blakeney

Staff Present:

Grace Smith, Planning Supervisor
Karla Rosenberg, Planner
Joanne Gordon, Clerk

III. Adjustments to the Agenda

Move case COA1800030 to second on the agenda.

MOTION: Approve the adjustments to the Agenda. (DeBerry, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Motion carried, 8-0.

IV. Approval of Summary Minutes for April 3, 2018

MOTION: Approve the Minutes from April 3, 2018 (DeBerry, Waiters 2nd).

ACTION: Motion carried, 8-0

V. Swearing-In of Witnesses

Chair Jordan read the opening HPC statement, and asked if there were any early dismissals required by Commission members or Commission members who might have a conflict of interest with the cases presented today. No conflicts of interest were noted, and no early dismissals were requested.

The Clerk to the Board administered the oath to all Citizens and staff who wished to speak at today's meeting.

VI. Certificates of Appropriateness

After the oath was given, Ms. Rosenberg asked that all staff reports and materials submitted at the meeting be made part of the permanent record with any additions, deletions, and or corrections that may be necessary. All Commission members concurred.

a. Case COA1800012 – 115 North Duke Street - Signage.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Barr spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Barr gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 115 North Duke Street - Signage.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with option of connecting the new tagline via exterior wire painted to match the brick.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800012, 115 North Duke Street - Signage:

- The applicant is proposing to expand existing signage on a landmark property.
- A tagline sign measuring 10 inches by 218 inches will be installed below existing signage, bringing total signage measurements to 48 square feet.
- The new signage will be attached via five new 3/8-inch penetrations in the masonry mortar joints, without penetrating any bricks, approximately 9.5 inches below existing signage and 29 inches above upper windows. Applicant will consider where possible using existing penetrations.
- A new electrical conduit shall connect to the existing conduit on the exterior of the building, without making any new holes, and shall be painted to match the underlying brick.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800012, 115 North Duke Street - Signage, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans submitted to the Commission as part of the application.
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, DeBerry 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

b. Case COA1800030 – 1012 Shepherd Street – Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Bogart spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Bogart gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1012 Shepherd Street – Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Ms. Hamilton made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800030, 1012 Shepherd Street – Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a front-yard fence for a contributing structure.
- The four-foot tall wood fence with copper post caps will surround the front yard and will include a front gate and a side gate; the applicant is responsible for ensuring the fence does not encroach into the public right of way.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800030, 1012 Shepherd Street – Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Hamilton, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

c. Case COA1800018 – 1105 Georgia Avenue – Addition and Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Black spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Black gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1105 Georgia Avenue – Addition and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. DeBerry made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800018, 1105 Georgia Avenue – Addition and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing an addition to a contributing structure.
- A nonoriginal screened porch will be removed and a new two-story addition constructed in its place.
- Four original windows will be salvaged from the original structure for reuse on the new addition.

- The addition will use six-over-six, double-hung fiberglass windows; German-profiled wood lap siding; asphalt roof shingles; and K-style gutters.
- A new screened porch will be constructed of pressure-treated lumber at the rear of the new addition.
- Existing nonoriginal vinyl cladding will be removed from the home's front and rear dormers.
- A parking pad of poured concrete, measuring 20 feet by 23 feet, will be added at the termination of the driveway in the rear yard.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800018, 1105 Georgia Avenue – Addition and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(DeBerry, Bouchard 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

d. Case COA1800019 – 113 West Main Street – Modifications.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Berghausen spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Berghausen gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 113 West Main Street - Modifications.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with conditions as stated.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800019, 113 West Main Street – Modifications:

- The applicant is proposing the removal of a nonoriginal facade and installation of a new facade on a noncontributing structure.
- The new facade will be composed of a butt-glazed glass storefront system, a round glass window measuring 6 feet 8 inches in diameter, a brushed brass accent column, and solid one-inch thick marble surrounds at the first-floor level; dark oxidized metal panels at the second-floor level; and a two-story red copper metal awning.
- At least two second-floor windows will be reinstated with aluminum-clad wood, four-over-four double-hung windows on the rear elevation.

- A rear exit door composed of metal will be enlarged from 4 to 6 feet in width, adding one additional hollow metal leaf.
- The COA shall not be issued until applicant submits all cladding and fastening details to commission staff for review and approval. All cladding and fastening materials shall perform as presented by applicant at hearing with respect to such issues as galvanic corrosion and oil canning.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800019, 113 West Main Street – Modifications, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Bouchard, Hamilton 2nd)

ACTION: Approved with conditions, 8–0

e. Case COA1800020 – 909 Cobb Street – Sign and Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Ms. Frederick spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Ms. Frederick gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 909 Cobb Street – Sign and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application.

MOTION: Mr. Dayan made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800020, 909 Cobb Street – Sign and Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a monument sign and flagstone pathway on a noncontributing property.
- The monument sign will consist of a blue and white vinyl cabinet measuring four feet tall by six feet wide, mounted to a brick masonry base of approximately eight feet in width that matches the brick of the primary structure.
- A flagstone pathway will lead from the existing concrete walkway to the sign.
- An existing arborvitae will be transplanted immediately adjacent to the sign.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of

Appropriateness for case COA1800020, 909 Cobb Street – Sign and Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Dayan, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

f. Case COA1800021 – 1108 Wall Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Percy spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Percy gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 1108 Wall Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended continuance to June 5, 2018 meeting to allow applicant to modify proposal.

MOTION: Mr. Bouchard made a motion to continue consideration of case COA1800021, 1108 Wall Street – Addition, Modifications, and Site Work to the next commission meeting scheduled for June 5, 2018.

(Bouchard, Fitzsimons 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

g. Case COA1800024 – 201 East Main Street – Site Work.

Staff Report: Karla Rosenberg presented the case.

Speakers: Mr. Siler, Mr. Wilson, Mr. Brady spoke in support. No one spoke in opposition.

Discussion: Mr. Wilson gave a brief overview of the proposed project of 201 East Main Street – Site Work.

Staff Recommendation: Staff recommended approval of application with the addition of plaque to attach to sculpture.

MOTION: Mr. Fitzsimons made a motion that the Durham Historic Preservation Commission finds that, in the case COA1800024, 201 East Main Street – Site Work:

- The applicant is proposing a public art installation in the street yard of a noncontributing structure.
- The art will consist of a stainless steel sculpture measuring 14 feet 6 inches in height and 8 feet 4 inches in width, mounted upon a 5-foot tall and 8-foot squared poured concrete base and a 1-foot tall concrete footing; the footing and part of the base (at

least 1.5 feet) will be located below grade, creating a total height of 19.5 feet above grade.

- The sculpture's base will be placed approximately 12.5 feet from the sidewalk and 18.5 feet from the street, surrounded by 18-inch shrubs.
- The sculpture will be internally illuminated via light-emitting diode (LED) tubes and oriented westward.
- The application will also include an informative plaque as stated in the meeting by the applicant.
- The application includes site modifications as reflected in the landscaping plan as presented as part of the application.

Therefore, the conclusion of law is that the proposed addition and alterations are consistent with the historic character and qualities of the Historic District and are consistent with the Historic Properties Local Review Criteria, specifically those listed in the staff report, and the Durham Historic Preservation Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness for case COA1800024, 201 East Main Street – Site Work, with the following conditions:

1. The improvements shall be substantially consistent with the plans and testimony presented to the Commission at this Commission hearing and attached to this COA;
2. The improvements may require additional approvals from other City or County departments or state or local agencies; the applicant is responsible for obtaining all required approvals relating to building construction, site work, and work in the right-of-way; and
3. A compliance inspection shall be performed immediately upon completion of the work approved herein.

(Fitzsimons, Waiters 2nd)

ACTION: Approved, 8–0

VII. Old Business

- a) Criteria Update – Part I will take place during the June HPC hearing, which is expected to have a minimal caseload; Part II will take place during the staff retreat, set for Monday, June 25 from 11am to 1pm.

VIII. New Business

- a) Administrative COA – none appeared in query – will verify that Minor COA approvals are accounted for by LDO query.

IX. Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 11:07 a.m.

Respectfully Submitted,

Terri Elliott, Clerk
Historic Preservation Commission